COMPLAINT AND DEMAND FOR TRIAL BY JURY

1. This is an action for actual and statutory damages for violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act (hereafter the "FDCPA"), 15 U.S.C. §1692 et seq. and the Telephone Consumer Protection Act, Sec. 227., 47 USC § 227(b)(1), 47 USC § 227(a) (iii) (hereafter the "TCPA").

PARTIES

- 2. Plaintiff, Monica Mitchell ("Plaintiff" or "Mitchell") is a natural person and at all times a resident of the state of California and the County of Riverside, and a "consumer" as that term is defined by 15 U.S.C. §1692a(3).
- 3. Defendant Western Dental Services, Inc. ("Western Dental") is a "creditor" as that term is defined by 15 U.S.C. §1692a(4) and a "debt collector" as that term is defined by 15 U.S.C. §1692a(6) and sought to collect a consumer debt from Plaintiff.
- 4. Defendant acted through its agents, employees, officers, members, directors, heirs, successors, assigns, principals, trustees, sureties, subrogees, representatives, and insurers.

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

5. Jurisdiction of this Court arises pursuant to 15 U.S.C. §1692k, which states that such actions may be brought and heard before "any

11

12

13 14

15

16 17

18

19

20 21

22

23 24

25

26

27

28

appropriate United States district court without regard to the amount in controversy," under 47 U.S.C. §227(b)(3), and 28 U.S.C. §1331 grants this court original jurisdiction of all civil actions arising under the laws of the United States.

- Venue is proper pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §1391b. Venue in this 6. District is proper in that the Plaintiff resides here, the Defendant transacts business here, and the conduct complained of occurred here.
- Declaratory relief is available pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§2201 and 7. 2202.
- This is an action for damages which exceed \$75,000.00. 8.

FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

- At all pertinent times hereto, Defendant Western Dental was 9. attempting to collect a consumer debt from Plaintiff.
- 10. The alleged debt at issue arose out of transactions, which were primarily for personal, family, or household purposes and is therefore a "debt" as that term is defined by 15 U.S.C. §1692a(5).
- 11. Beginning in or before September 28, 2012, Defendant Western Dental constantly and continuously placed collection calls to Plaintiff seeking and demanding payment for an alleged debt owed, notably, automated telephone calls as defined by the TCPA.

28

18.

On October 10, 2012, Plaintiff caused to fax and mail a Notice of

Ω

to Plaintiff's cellular phone.

Intent to File Lawsuit to Defendant. See Exhibit "2" attached hereto and incorporated herein by this reference.

- 19. On October 24, 2012 at 1:23 p.m., Defendant Western Dental placed an eighth automated telephone call to Plaintiff's cellular phone.
- 20. On October 25, 2012 at 12:24 p.m., 6:47 p.m. and 7:25 p.m.,

 Defendant placed a ninth, tenth and eleventh automated telephone call
- 21. On October 26, 2012 at 9:17 a.m. and 10:14 a.m., Defendant
 Western Dental placed a twelfth and thirteenth automated telephone
 call to Plaintiff's cellular phone.
- 22. From October 27, 2012 to present date, Defendant Western Dental placed at least six additional automated telephone calls to Plaintiff's cellular phone.
- 23. In all of the phone calls to Plaintiff, the automated system announces "Hello, this is a call for Monica Mitchell. This is [Representative's Name] calling from Western Dental. Please hold for an important call. All calls are monitored and recorded for quality control purposes. This is an attempt to collect a debt."
- 24. Defendant Western Dental placed constant collection calls to Plaintiff from telephone numbers: 877-703-4109, 877-703-4110 and

866-620-8390.

2

6

8

9

10 11

12

13

14 15

16

17 18

19

20

21

22

23

24 25

26

27

28

Defendant Western Dental's sole purpose in contacting Plaintiff 25. several times a day and/or once every two, three, four or five days, was to harass Plaintiff.

From October 2, 2012 through October 26, 2012, Defendant 26. Western Dental violated the TCPA by leaving XX recorded messages using automatic telephone dialing system or artificial or prerecorded voices on Plaintiffs cell phone.

From October 2, 2012 through November 27, 2012, Defendant Western Dental violated the TCPA by calling Plaintiff's cell phone 19 times without permission or authority given by Plaintiff.

From October 2, 2012 through November 27, 2012, Defendant 28. Western Dental violated the TCPA by leaving recorded messages on Plaintiff's cell phone without express permission.

Through this conduct, Defendant Western Dental engaged in 29. conduct the natural consequence of which was to harass, oppress, or abuse a person in connection with the collection of a debt.

Consequently, Defendant Western Dental violated 15 U.S.C. §1692d.

Through this conduct, Defendant Western Dental used an unfair 30. or unconscionable means to collect or attempt to collect a debt.

37. As a result of each and every violation of 15 U.S.C. §1692f,
Plaintiff is entitled to statutory damages in an amount up to \$1,000.00 from each and every defendant, jointly and severally.

THIRD CLAIM FOR RELIEF

VIOLATIONS OF THE TELEPHONE

COMMUNICATIONS ACT 47 U.S.C. §227

BY DEFENDANT WESTERN DENTAL SERVICES, INC.

- 38. Plaintiff incorporates by reference all of the above paragraphs of this Complaint as though fully stated herein.
- 39. Defendant Western Dental has demonstrated willful or knowing non-compliance with 47 U.S.C. §227(b)(1)(A) by using an automatic telephone dialing system to call the Plaintiff's number, which is assigned to a cellular telephone service.
- 40. Defendant Western Dental has committed 19 separate violations of 47 U.S.C. §227(b)(1)(A) and Plaintiff is entitled to damages of \$1500 per violation pursuant to 47 U.S.C. §227(b)(3)(B).
- 41. Defendant Western Dental has demonstrated willful or knowing non-compliance with 47 U.S.C. §227(b)(1)(A) The last 19 calls are subject to treble damages pursuant to 47 U.S.C. §227(b)(3) as they were intentional. Plaintiff spoke with Defendant Western Dental's

15.

representatives twice after sending a cease communication letter and twice after receiving the Notice of Intent to Sue Letter and blatantly ignored federal and state laws by continuing the harassing calls to Plaintiff. Since then Defendant Western Dental refuses and continues to violate 47 U.S.C. An unintentional call carries a damage amount of \$500; an intentional call carries a damage amount of \$1,500 per violation.

42. Defendant Western Dental has demonstrated willful or knowing non-compliance with 47 U.S.C. §227(b)(1)(A) by calling the Plaintiff's number, which is assigned to a cellular telephone service. The Plaintiff has never given Defendant Western Dental permission to call Plaintiffs cell phone as of September 28, 2012. Plaintiff is entitled to damages of \$1500 per violation pursuant to 47 U.S.C. §227(b)(3)(B).

43. Defendant Western Dental has demonstrated willful or knowing non-compliance with 47 U.S.C. §227(b)(1)(A) by continuing to call Plaintiff 19 times after receiving the cease communication letter in violation of 47 U.S.C. §227.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff demands judgment for damages against
Defendant Western Dental for actual or statutory damages, and
punitive damages, and costs.

<u>.</u>1

2

3

56

7

9

8

10

1112

13

1415

16

17

18

19

20

2122

23

24

25

///

26

27

28 |

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests judgment be entered against Defendant, and Plaintiff be awarded damages from Defendant, as follows:

- a. An award of actual damages pursuant to 15 U.S.C. §1692k(a)(1);
- b. An award of statutory damages of \$1,000.00 as to each and every violation of 15 U.S.C. §§1692d, and f as to each defendant;

Inc. violated the FDCPA and TCPA;

- c. Declaratory judgment that Defendant Western Dental Services,
- d. Statutory damages pursuant to the TCPA, \$1,500.00 to Plaintiff, for each violation;
- e. Costs and reasonable attorneys' fees, if and when applicable, pursuant to 15 U.S.C. §1692k(a)(3);
- f. Any other relief that this Honorable Court deems appropriate.

 Respectfully submitted this 27th day of November, 2012.

Monica Mitchell, Plaintiff in Pro-Per

10

DEMAND FOR TRIAL BY JURY

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that Plaintiff demands a trial by jury in this case.

Monica Mitchell Plaintiff in Pro Per

VERIFICATION

I, Monica Mitchell, am the Plaintiff in the above-entitled action. I have read the foregoing Complaint and know the contents thereof. The same is true of my own knowledge, except as to those matters which are therein alleged on information and belief, and as to those matters, I believe it to be true. I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed this 27th day of November, 2012, in Corona, California.

Monica Mitchell

ase 5:1	.2-cv-02084-FMO-SP	Document 1	Filed 11/28/12	Page 13 of 21	Page ID #:13
1					
2					
3 4					
5					
6					
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12 13					
14					
15					
16					
17			•		
18					
19					
20					
21 22					
23					
24					
25			Exhibit 1		
26					
27		,			
28					
f		COMPLAINT AN	- 13 - D DEMAND FOR T	RIAL BY MIRV	

Monica Mitchell

1683 Tamarron Drive

Corona, CA 92883

September 28, 2012

Western Dental

Via Facsimile Transmittal 714/571-3570

Re: Account of Monica Mitchell

To whom it may concern:

Pursuant to my rights under federal debt collection laws, I am requesting that you cease and desist communication with me, as well as my family and friends, in relation to this and all other alleged debts you claim I owe. I repeat, you do not have permission to call my cell phone @ 951-316-3298.

You are hereby notified that if you do not comply with this request, I will immediately file a complaint with the Federal Trade Commission and the California Attorney General's office.

Civil and criminal claims will be pursued.

Sincerely,

Monica Mitchell

			-		
Case 5	12-cv-02084-FMO-SP	Document 1	Filed 11/28/12	Page 15 of 21	Page ID #:15
.*					
5 1					
2					
3					i e
4					
5					
6					
7					
8		· ·			
9					
10 11					
12	·				
13					
14					
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22			Exhibit 2		
23					
24					
25					
26	+				
27					
28			· ·		
. ;			- 14 - ID DEMAND FOR T	RIAL RV MIRV	
*		COMPLAINT AN	U DEMAND FOR I	RIAL DI JUKI	

Monica Mitchell-Graham Erwin Graham 1683 Tamarron Drive Corona, CA 92883

October 10, 2012

Via Facsimile Transmittal 714/571-3570 and U.S. Mail

Western Dental Services, Inc. P.O. Box 14228 Orange, CA 92863-1228

Notice of Intent to File Lawsuit

Re: Account #10-049472

To Whom It May Concern:

Please be advised that this letter shall serve as formal notice of our intent to file a lawsuit against your company, due to your negligence and blatant and objectionable disregard of the law, for extensive damages for violating, including, but not limited to, the Telephone Collection Practices Act ("TCPA") and the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act ("FDCPA").

If you wish to resolve this matter, this will be your last opportunity to do so. In the meantime, the amount of \$1500.00 per violation shall continue to accrue with each additional violation by your company. Western Dental has no later than 2:00 p.m. PST Monday, October 15, 2012 to resolve this matter, and you may only make contact by email: monica_graham@rocketmail.com. We hereby put you on notice that Western Dental's failure to do so may result in WESTERN DENTAL SERVICES, INC. to be named in a lawsuit for full civil liability.

Submitted with All Rights Reserved,

Monica Mitchell-Graham

Erwin Graham

PROOF OF SERVICE

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

NOTICE OF ASSIGNMENT TO UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE FOR DISCOVERY

This case has been assigned to District Judge Percy Anderson and the assigned discovery Magistrate Judge is Sheri Pym.

The case number on all documents filed with the Court should read as follows:

EDCV12- 2084 PA (SPx)

Pursuant to General Order 05-07 of the United States District Court for the Central District of California, the Magistrate Judge has been designated to hear discovery related motions.

All discovery related motions should be noticed on the calendar of the Magistrate Judge

NOTICE TO COUNSEL

A copy of this notice must be served with the summons and complaint on all defendants (if a removal action is filed, a copy of this notice must be served on all plaintiffs).

Subsequent documents must be filed at the following location:

\ /	
M	Western Division
<i>y</i>	312 N. Spring St., Rm. G-8
,	Los Angeles, CA 90012

Southern Division
411 West Fourth St., Rm. 1-053
Santa Ana, CA 92701-4516

Eastern Division 3470 Twelfth St., Rm. 134 Riverside, CA 92501

Failure to file at the proper location will result in your documents being returned to you.

Case 5:12-cv-02084-FMO-SP Document 1 Filed 11/28/12 Page 19 of 21 Page ID #:19 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA CIVIL COVER SHEET

I (a) PLAINTIFFS (Check box if you are representing yourself M) MONICA MITCHELL		DEFENDANTS WESTERN DENTAL S	SERVICES, INC.	
(b) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address and Telephone Number. If you are yourself, provide same.)	representing	Attorneys (If Known)		
MONICA MITCHELL IN PRO PER (951) 316-3298 1683 TAMARRON DRIVE CORONA, CA 92883				
II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION (Place an X in one box only.)	III. CITIZEN (Place an 2	SHIP OF PRINCIPAL PA X in one box for plaintiff and	RTIES - For Diversi	ty Cases Only
☐ 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff 2 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government Not a Party)	Citizen of This	P.	FF DEF 1 □ 1 Incorpora	PTF DEF ated or Principal Place
☐ 2 U.S. Government Defendant ☐ 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)	Citizen of Anot	her State	2 □ 2 Incorpora	ated and Principal Place 5 5
	Citizen or Subje	ect of a Foreign Country	3 □3 Foreign N	Nation
IV. ORIGIN (Place an X in one box only.)				
Original Proceeding Proceding Proceeding Pro				
V. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT: JURY DEMAND: ▼Yes □	No (Check 'Yes	only if demanded in compl	aint.)	
CLASS ACTION under F.R.C.P. 23: ☐ Yes VNo		MONEY DEMANDED IN	COMPLAINT: \$ 75	,000.00
VI. CAUSE OF ACTION (Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you an	re filing and wri	te a brief statement of cause.	Do not cite jurisdict	ional statutes unless diversity.)
15 USC 1692D, F, TCPA VII. NATURE OF SUIT (Place an X in one box only.)				
2007/2000 - 1200	600 Microsophus and a victoria and a second			
OTHER STATUTES CONTRACT □ 400 State Reapportionment □ 110 Insurance PERS	TORTS SONAL INJURY	TORTS PERSONAL	PRISONER	
	Airplane	PROPERTY	PETITIONS D 510 Motions to	
	Airplane Produc		Vacate Ser	ntence 720 Labor/Mgmt.
	Liability Assault, Libel &	☐ 371 Truth in Lending ☐ 380 Other Personal		rpus Relations
	Slander	Property Damag	☐ 530 General se ☐ 535 Death Pena	□ 730 Labor/Mgmt. Reporting &
- Islandicomon of	Fed. Employers'	☐ 385 Property Damag	e 540 Mandamus	/ Disclosure Act
and Corrupt Judgment Organizations □ 151 Medicare Act □ 340	Liability Marine	Product Liability	Other	☐ 740 Railway Labor Act
480 Consumer Credit	Marine Product	BANKRUPTCY ☐ 422 Appeal 28 USC	☐ 550 Civil Right ☐ 555 Prison Con	
☐ 490 Cable/Sat TV Student Loan (Excl.	Liability Motor Vehicle	158	FORFEITURI	management and a second a second and a second a second and a second a second and a second and a second and a
Li 810 Selective Selvice (Veterans)	Motor Vehicle	☐ 423 Withdrawal 28	PENALTY	Security Act
	Product Liability	USC 157 CIVIL RIGHTS	☐ 610 Agriculture	
7 875 Customer Challenge 12 Votoron's Bonefite	Other Personal Injury	□ 441 Voting	☐ 620 Other Food Drug	& □ 820 Copyrights □ 830 Patent
USC 3410 \square 160 Stockholders' Suits \square 362 \square	Personal Injury-	☐ 442 Employment	☐ 625 Drug Relate	
	Med Malpractice		Seizure of	SOCIAL SECURITY
7 000 F-1-1-1 Graffit at	Personal Injury- Product Liability	mmodations ☐ 444 Welfare	881	USC □ 861 HIA (1395ff) □ 862 Black Lung (923)
Act ☐ 196 Franchise ☐ 368 A	Asbestos Persona	3	☐ 630 Liquor Law	/s 4
	Injury Product Liability	Disabilities -	□ 640 R.R. & Tru	ck (405(g))
	Jiability MIGRATION	Employment Graph 446 American with	☐ 650 Airline Reg ☐ 660 Occupation	s '` B64 SSID Title XVI
□ 900 Appeal of Fee Determi- □ 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment □ 462 1	Vaturalization	Disabilities -	Safety /Hea	
	Application Habeas Corpus-	Other	☐ 690 Other	□ 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff
— = 10 1010 Diability	Alien Detainee	☐ 440 Other Civil Rights	1	or Defendant)
State Statutes	Other Immigratio	n Rights	1	USC 7609
	Actions	* · · · · · · •		186.
DW 0141 4 W	1723	honon		ch.
ED CV 12	<u> </u>	02083		JLX

AFTER COMPLETING THE FRONT SIDE OF FORM CV-71, COMPLETE THE INFORMATION REQUESTED BELOW.

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY: Case Number:

Case 5:12-cv-02084-FMO-SP Document 1 Filed 11/28/12 Page 20 of 21 Page ID #:20 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA CIVIL COVER SHEET

VIII(a). IDENTICAL CASES: Ha	as this action been p	oreviously filed in this court and dismissed, remanded or closed? ■ No □ Yes		
	e any cases been p	reviously filed in this court that are related to the present case? VNO Yes		
□ B. □ C.	Arise from the san Call for determina For other reasons	ase and the present case: ne or closely related transactions, happenings, or events; or tion of the same or substantially related or similar questions of law and fact; or would entail substantial duplication of labor if heard by different judges; or patent, trademark or copyright, and one of the factors identified above in a, b or c also is present.		
IX. VENUE: (When completing the	e following informa	ation, use an additional sheet if necessary.)		
(a) List the County in this District; ☐ Check here if the government,	California County its agencies or empl	outside of this District; State if other than California; or Foreign Country, in which EACH named plaintiff resides. loyees is a named plaintiff. If this box is checked, go to item (b).		
County in this District:*		California County outside of this District; State, if other than California; or Foreign Country		
ORANGE				
(b) List the County in this District; Check here if the government, i	California County ts agencies or empl	outside of this District; State if other than California; or Foreign Country, in which EACH named defendant resides. oyees is a named defendant. If this box is checked, go to item (c).		
County in this District:*		California County outside of this District; State, if other than California; or Foreign Country		
RIVERSIDE				
		outside of this District; State if other than California; or Foreign Country, in which EACH claim arose. on of the tract of land involved.		
County in this District:*		California County outside of this District; State, if other than California; or Foreign Country		
RIVERSIDE				
* Los Angeles, Orange, San Bernar Note: In land condemnation cases, us	dino, Riverside, V	entura, Santa Barbara, or Jan Luis Obispo Counties		
	_	Marin 1/- 27-12		
or other papers as required by lav	te CV-71 (JS-44) C v. This form, appro ourt for the purpose	Date		
Nature of Suit Code	Abbreviation	Substantive Statement of Cause of Action		
861 ·	ніа	All claims for health insurance benefits (Medicare) under Title 18, Part A, of the Social Security Act, as amended. Also, include claims by hospitals, skilled nursing facilities, etc., for certification as providers of services under the program. (42 U.S.C. 1935FF(b))		
862	BL	All claims for "Black Lung" benefits under Title 4, Part B, of the Federal Coal Mine Health and Safety Act of 1969. (30 U.S.C. 923)		
863	DIWC	All claims filed by insured workers for disability insurance benefits under Title 2 of the Social Security Act, as amended; plus all claims filed for child's insurance benefits based on disability. (42 U.S.C. 405(g))		
863	DIWW	All claims filed for widows or widowers insurance benefits based on disability under Title 2 of the Social Security Act, as amended. (42 U.S.C. 405(g))		
864	SSID	All claims for supplemental security income payments based upon disability filed under Title 16 of the Social Security Act, as amended.		
865	RSI	All claims for retirement (old age) and survivors benefits under Title 2 of the Social Security Act, as amended. (42 U.S.C. (g))		

CV-71 (05/08)

	ument 1 Filed 11/28/12 Page 21 of 21 Page ID #:21
Name & Address: Monica Mitchell 1683 Tamarron Dr. Corona, CA 92883 951-316-3298 monica_graham@rocketmail.com	
	STATES DISTRICT COURT L DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
MONICA MITCHELL, an individual	CASE TUMBER
V. V	EP-C V312 - 02084 PA
WESTERN DENTAL SERVICES, INC. and through 10, inclusive	d Does 1
•	SUMMONS ENDANT(S).
TO: DEFENDANT(S):	
must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the at □ counterclaim □ cross-claim or a motion un or motion must be served on the plaintiff's att 1683 Tamarron Drive, Corona, CA 92883	his summons on you (not counting the day you received it), you ttached complaint amended complaint amended Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer torney, Monica Mitchell in Pro Per , whose address is . If you fail to do so,
judgment by default will be entered against your answer or motion with the court.	ou for the relief demanded in the complaint. You also must file TERRY NAFISI
	Clerk, U.S. District Court
MOV 28 2012	LONG MANGO MEAD
Dated:	By:
	sed of the court
[Use 60 days if the defendant is the United States or a 60 days by Rule 12(a)(3)].	United States agency, or is an officer of employee of the United States. Allowed (1134)
[Use 60 days if the defendant is the United States or a 60 days by Rule 12(a)(3)].	
[Use 60 days if the defendant is the United States or a 60 days by Rule 12(a)(3)].	United States agency, or is an officer of employee of the United States. Allowed (1134)
[Use 60 days if the defendant is the United States or a 60 days by Rule 12(a)(3)].	